National Artificial Intelligence Advisory Committee

May 4, 2022

Federal Advisory Committee Public Meeting Minutes

Committee Members:

- Miriam Vogel, Chair
- James Manyika, Vice Chair
- Zoe Baird
- Yll Bajraktari
- Amanda Ballantyne
- Sayan Chakraborty
- Jack Clark
- David Danks
- Victoria Espinel
- Paula Goldman
- Susan Gonzales (virtual)
- Janet Haven
- Daniel Ho
- Ayanna Howard (virtual)
- Jon Kleinberg
- Ramayya Krishnan
- Ashley Llorens
- Haniyeh Mahmoudian
- Christina Montgomery (virtual)
- Liz O'Sullivan
- Fred Oswald (virtual)
- Frank Pasquale
- Trooper Sanders
- Navrina Singh
- Swami Sivasubramanian (virtual)
- Keith Strier
- Reggie Townsend

Staff Members Present:

- Melissa Banner, Designated Federal Officer, National Institute of Standards and Technology
- Charles Romine, National Institute of Standards and Technology
- Elham Tabassi, National Institute of Standards and Technology
- Heather Evans, National Institute of Standards and Technology
- Jenilee Keefe Singer, National Institute of Standards and Technology
- Natasha Bansgopaul, National Institute of Standards and Technology
- Meredith Schoenfeld, U.S. Patent and Trademark Office

Welcome and Opening Remarks:
Melissa Banner, Designated Federal Officer

- The Designated Federal Officer for the National Artificial Intelligence Advisory Committee calls the meeting to order at 1:01 PM Eastern time, and confirms the committee is operating under the Federal Advisory Committee Act and accessible to the public via livestream.

Miriam Vogel, Chair of the National Artificial Intelligence Advisory Committee.

- Welcome remarks to attendees and livestream participants
- Introduction of Government officials in attendance:
    o Secretary of Commerce Gina Raimondo
    o Deputy Secretary of Commerce Don Graves
    o Under Secretary of Commerce for Standards and Technology and Director of the National Institute of Standards and Technology Dr. Laurie Locascio
    o Acting Director of the White House Office of Science and Technology Policy Dr. Alondra Nelson
    o Director of the OSTP National AI Initiative Office Dr. Lynne Parker
    o Director of NIST's Information Technology Laboratory Dr. Charles Romine

Department Welcome and Charge to the Committee
The Honorable Gina Raimondo, Secretary of Commerce

- Secretary Raimondo thanks the committee chairs and other 25 members for participation and attendance.
- The Secretary asks the members to focus on workforce development and education to ensure people that look like America are involved at every level and are a part of the AI use cases.
- The Secretary also emphasizes her work relating to the US-EU Trade and Technology Council (TTC) and the Indo-Pacific Economic Framework (IPEF) and discusses the need for international cooperation and to work with our allies and create technology standards.

Insights on Artificial Intelligence from U.S. Government Officials
Miriam Vogel, Chair, NAIAC: Provides Introductions to U.S. Government Officials

The Honorable Don Graves, Deputy Secretary of Commerce

- Deputy Secretary Graves provides remarks to committee members. He emphasizes the opportunities and risks AI development provides and highlights AI as a priority in strategic competition with China.
- He notes economic equity through use of AI systems and policies is of particular interest to the Commerce Department.

Dr. Alondra Nelson, Acting Director, Office of Science and Technology Policy

- Dr. Nelson emphasizes the importance of access to AI benefits for all Americans, not only the few.
- Regarding creation of AI systems, she notes there must be appropriate recourse for people who build systems who violate basic rights. Dr. Nelson also emphasizes that the task is to maximize the technology while minimizing injury ("harness the good, banish the bad").
- She commends the wide range of perspectives on the committee and highlighted the need to increase opportunities for a diverse population, not only those who have traditionally benefited.
- Dr. Nelson also discusses AI's potential to help society, such as in the fight against climate change or to fix infrastructure.

The Honorable Dr. Laurie Locascio, Under Secretary of Commerce for Standards and Technology & Director of the National Institute of Standards and Technology (includes NAIAC Member Introduction)

- Dr. Locascio expresses gratitude to attendees and members of the committee for their service.
- Dr. Locascio makes note of NIST's pleasure to assist with administrative duties of the committee as a key federal laboratory focused on innovation.
- Dr. Locascio notes the belief that scientific and research innovation in emerging technologies such as AI have the potential to uplift and empower all people.
- She also reiterates Secretary Raimondo's remarks regarding the committee's role, which will help the federal government to develop and implement trustworthy AI that reinforces democratic values and respects human rights
- She formally introduces each NAIAC member.

Dr. Lynne Parker, Director, OSTP's National Artificial Intelligence Initiative Office

- Dr. Lynne Parker thanks the leadership of the DOC and NIST, OSTP, and National AI Initiative Office, noting that critical work needs to be done and is thankful to have experts to assist in these challenges.
- Dr. Parker discusses the work of the National AI Initiative Office, highlighting the taskforce that was created to provide an AI resource that if built could allow greater access and allow underserved communities to participate in the AI landscape. She identifies that there is a resource divide currently, which is preventing diversity in AI research and development.

Miriam Vogel, Chair, NAIAC: Gratitude to U.S. Government Officials

NAIAC Member Business
Miriam Vogel, Chair, NAIAC

- Committee Chair Vogel provides remarks on the background and scope of the NAIAC:
  - The National Artificial Intelligence Advisory Committee was established in accordance with the requirements of Section 5104 of the National Artificial Intelligence Initiative Act of 202 (Pub. L. No. 116-283)
  - NAIAC is tasked with advising the President and the National AI Initiative Office on topics related to the National AI Initiative.
  - The Secretary of Commerce appointed the 27 members in April 2022.
- Of note, a few of the committee's goals are to ensure the committee provides thoughtful actionable recommendations and that the committee share these details with the general public and encourage participation.

James Manyika, Vice Chair, NAIAC

- Mr. Manyika provides remarks. He highlights the parallel of the committee's work with his role serving as a guest editor for journal on AI & Society for Daedalus journal from American Academy of Arts and Sciences and reiterated that diversity in thought is very much welcome.

Establishment of the Law Enforcement and Artificial Intelligence Subcommittee: Miriam Vogel, NAIAC Chair

- Chair Vogel announces the establishment of a subcommittee on matters relating to the development of artificial intelligence relating to law enforcement matters, as per section 5104(c) of the William M. (Mac) Thornberry National Defense Authorization Act for Fiscal Year 2021.

- Chair Vogal requests DOC and NIST staff proceed with the member appointment process.

Discussion on the NAIAC Organization and Priorities: Miriam Vogel, NAIAC Chair

- To address the NAIAC's statutory charge, and to hone the focus of the Committee, the NAIAC staff recommend dividing the NAIAC's 13 statutory duties among five working groups, which would focus on specific topic areas.
- Chair Vogel introduces the creation of five working groups. The groups include:
  - 1) Leadership in Trustworthy Artificial Intelligence
  - 2) Leadership in Research & Development
  - 3) Supporting the U.S. Workforce and Providing Opportunity
  - 4) U.S. Leadership and Competitiveness
  - 5) International Cooperation
- The Chair and Vice Chair will not serve on any one group and each member will serve on two groups.

Working Group 1: Leadership in Trustworthy Artificial Intelligence

- Provide advice and recommendations on how to lead the world in the development and use of trustworthy artificial intelligence systems in the public and private sectors.
- Explore approaches to assess, evaluate, and govern the trustworthiness of AI systems.

Members:

- Chair: Victoria Espinel
- David Danks
- Victoria Espinel
- Paula Goldman
- Janet Haven
- Daniel Ho
- Ayanna Howard
- Jon Kleinberg
- Christina Montgomery
- Liz O'Sullivan
- Fred Oswald
- Navrina Singh

Working Group 2: Leadership in Research & Development

- Provide advice and recommendations on how to ensure continued U.S. leadership in artificial intelligence research and development
- Provide a long-term vision for U.S. investment in AI R&D with a focus on co-innovation and application within other science fields.

Members

- Co-Chair Ayanna Howard
- Co-Chair Ashley Llorens
- Jack Clark
- Janet Haven
- Jon Kleinberg
- Ramayya Krishnan
- Haniyeh Mahmoudian
- Liz O'Sullivan
- Swami Sivasubramanian

Working Group 3: Supporting the U.S. Workforce and Providing Opportunity

- Provide advice and recommendations on how to prepare the present and future U.S. workforce for the integration of AI systems across all sectors of the economy and society.
- Ensure any recommendations include educating the current and future workforce on the promise and potential of AI, and support the development of a diverse workforce, with opportunity for all regions.

Members:

- Chair: Trooper Sanders
- Zoe Baird
- Amanda Ballantyne
- Sayan Chakraborty
- Susan Gonzales
- Haniyeh Mahmoudian
- Christina Montgomery
- Fred Oswald
- Frank Pasquale
- Reggie Townsend

Working Group 4: U.S. Leadership and Competitiveness

- Provide advice and recommendation of how to organize the U.S. government to better coordinate ongoing and future artificial activities among the civilian agencies, the Department of Defense, and the Intelligence Community to ensure that each informs the work of the others.
- Review existing legal and regulatory structures that inhibit the U.S. government from providing strategic leadership on AI.

Members:

- Chair: Yll Bajraktari
- Jack Clark
- Victoria Espinel
- Paula Goldman
- Susan Gonzales
- Daniel Ho
- Trooper Sanders
- Keith Strier
- Reggie Townsend

Work Group 5: International Cooperation

- Provide advice and recommendation on ensuring policy and standard alignment with allies and partners.
- Explore opportunities to decrease barriers to trade.

Members:

- Chair: Zoe Baird
- Yll Bajraktari
- Amanda Ballantyne
- Sayan Chakraborty
- David Danks
- Ramayya Krishnan
- Ashley Llorens
- Frank Pasquale
- Navrina Singh
- Swami Sivasubramanian
- Keith Strier

Public Comments: Miriam Vogel, NAIAC Chair and James Manyika, Vice Chair, NAIAC

- The Federal Register notice for public comments produced 47 questions and comments. The members address some of the key topics, including that many of the questions and comments touched topics to be addressed during the course of the committee's work.

Next Steps and Closing Remarks:
Miriam Vogel, NAIAC Chair

- The Chair and Vice Chair provide thank you remarks to the attendees and committee members and announce there will be one more committee meeting this calendar year.
- Remarks of gratitude also shared to all of the government officials and support staff who assisted to make the meeting a success.

Adjournment:

Melissa Banner, Designated Federal Officer

- The Designated Federal Officer for the National Artificial Intelligence Advisory Committee thanks all attendees and participants and adjourns the meeting at 3:01 PM Eastern time.