

---

**From:** Brian Ellrott - NOAA Federal <brian.ellrott@noaa.gov>  
**Sent:** Friday, April 26, 2019 12:21 PM  
**To:** Joe Heublein  
**Subject:** Fwd: ROC LTO - draft winter-run I&S

Did you address comments on the effects table, or are you kicking those to division leads? For example, Rosalie is asking each Response cell in the species effects table be written in terms of effects on individuals rather than statements about habitat. I assume you got that comment too. So, you doing that yourself?

----- Forwarded message -----

**From:** Brian Ellrott - NOAA Federal <[brian.ellrott@noaa.gov](mailto:brian.ellrott@noaa.gov)>  
**Date:** Fri, Apr 26, 2019 at 10:48 AM  
**Subject:** Re: ROC LTO - draft winter-run I&S  
**To:** Garwin Yip - NOAA Federal <[garwin.yip@noaa.gov](mailto:garwin.yip@noaa.gov)>, Joe Heublein <[joe.heublein@noaa.gov](mailto:joe.heublein@noaa.gov)>  
**Cc:** Rosalie del Rosario - NOAA Federal <[rosalie.delrosario@noaa.gov](mailto:rosalie.delrosario@noaa.gov)>, Brown, Howard <[Howard.Brown@noaa.gov](mailto:Howard.Brown@noaa.gov)>, Cathy Marcinkevage - NOAA Federal <[cathy.marcinkevage@noaa.gov](mailto:cathy.marcinkevage@noaa.gov)>, [Susan\\_Boring@fws.gov](mailto:Susan_Boring@fws.gov) <[Susan\\_Boring@fws.gov](mailto:Susan_Boring@fws.gov)>, Barbara Byrne - NOAA F... (Google Drive) <[barbara.byrne@noaa.gov](mailto:barbara.byrne@noaa.gov)>

Adding Joe to this thread.

On Fri, Apr 26, 2019 at 10:17 AM Garwin Yip - NOAA Federal <[garwin.yip@noaa.gov](mailto:garwin.yip@noaa.gov)> wrote:  
Thanks, Rosalie.

Brian (and the rest)--Definitely track changes on the whole time.

Brian and Joe--FYI, Cathy, Howard (latter part of call), and Rosalie met yesterday to discuss Rosalie's general comments, below, and agreed with them, and that they apply to the other species I&S sections for consistency. Thanks for the heady lift on these important sections.

-Garwin-

---

*Garwin Yip*  
Water Operations and Delta Consultations Branch Chief  
NOAA Fisheries West Coast Region  
U.S. Department of Commerce  
California Central Valley Office  
650 Capitol Mall, Suite 5-100  
Sacramento, CA 95814  
Office: 916-930-3611  
Cell: 916-716-6558  
FAX: 916-930-3629  
[www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov](http://www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov)



On Fri, Apr 26, 2019 at 10:06 AM Rosalie del Rosario - NOAA Federal <[rosalie.delrosario@noaa.gov](mailto:rosalie.delrosario@noaa.gov)> wrote:  
Hi Brian,

Track changes will be helpful for my next review. Folks can turn them off if it gets too crazy! 😊  
Rosalie

On Fri, Apr 26, 2019 at 10:02 AM Brian Ellrott - NOAA Federal <[brian.ellrott@noaa.gov](mailto:brian.ellrott@noaa.gov)> wrote:  
Unless I hear otherwise, I will have track changes on so it's clear how each comment was addressed.

On Fri, Apr 26, 2019 at 9:51 AM Brian Ellrott - NOAA Federal <[brian.ellrott@noaa.gov](mailto:brian.ellrott@noaa.gov)> wrote:  
Thanks Rosalie. I'll start on these now.

On Fri, Apr 26, 2019 at 9:33 AM Rosalie del Rosario - NOAA Federal <[rosalie.delrosario@noaa.gov](mailto:rosalie.delrosario@noaa.gov)> wrote:

Hi Brian,

Thanks for the draft. I offer preliminary comments on the draft winter run I&S section for your consideration.

Main comments:

- 1) use regulatory language of "likelihood of survival" and "likelihood of recovery" (rather than extinction) in the risk to ESU section. I offer some suggestions for your consideration.
- 2) how to present effects that are "uncertain" in the I&S tables. Probably shouldn't have uncertainty in the I&S tables given our effects analyses are based on assumptions we had to make in absence of information. For uncertainties with programmatic actions, we can describe our assumptions and note the uncertainties with programmatic actions may introduce additional risk to species.
- 3) double check in Tables that response of individuals and probable change in fitness are compatible.
- 4) suggest more explicit analyses of PBFs in the CH section.

Please let me know if you have any questions.

Thanks,  
Rosalie

On Mon, Apr 22, 2019 at 2:03 PM Brian Ellrott - NOAA Federal <[brian.ellrott@noaa.gov](mailto:brian.ellrott@noaa.gov)> wrote:  
Hi Rosalie,

Here's a draft of the subject doc for your review. You'll see there is still a bit of a placeholder/text to incorporate related to Shasta Reservoir temperature management, but otherwise it is ready for review.

It's also saved here:

R:\Draft BiOp\2\_ESA\2.8-2.9 Integration and Synthesis and Conclusion

Thanks,  
Brian

--

**Brian Ellrott**

*Central Valley Salmonid Recovery Coordinator  
NOAA Fisheries West Coast Region  
U.S. Department of Commerce  
Mobile: 916-955-7628  
Office: 916-930-3612  
[brian.ellrott@noaa.gov](mailto:brian.ellrott@noaa.gov)*

--

**Rosalie B. del Rosario, Ph.D.**

*Regional Endangered Species Act Advisor  
NOAA Fisheries West Coast Region  
U.S. Department of Commerce  
Office: (562) 980-4085  
[Rosalie.delRosario@noaa.gov](mailto:Rosalie.delRosario@noaa.gov)  
[www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov](http://www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov)*



--

**Brian Ellrott**

*Central Valley Salmonid Recovery Coordinator  
NOAA Fisheries West Coast Region  
U.S. Department of Commerce  
Mobile: 916-955-7628  
Office: 916-930-3612  
[brian.ellrott@noaa.gov](mailto:brian.ellrott@noaa.gov)*

--

**Brian Ellrott**

*Central Valley Salmonid Recovery Coordinator  
NOAA Fisheries West Coast Region  
U.S. Department of Commerce  
Mobile: 916-955-7628  
Office: 916-930-3612  
[brian.ellrott@noaa.gov](mailto:brian.ellrott@noaa.gov)*

--

**Rosalie B. del Rosario, Ph.D.**

*Regional Endangered Species Act Advisor  
NOAA Fisheries West Coast Region  
U.S. Department of Commerce  
Office: (562) 980-4085  
[Rosalie.delRosario@noaa.gov](mailto:Rosalie.delRosario@noaa.gov)  
[www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov](http://www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov)*



--

**Brian Ellrott**

*Central Valley Salmonid Recovery Coordinator*

*NOAA Fisheries West Coast Region*

*U.S. Department of Commerce*

Mobile: 916-955-7628

Office: 916-930-3612

[brian.ellrott@noaa.gov](mailto:brian.ellrott@noaa.gov)

--

**Brian Ellrott**

*Central Valley Salmonid Recovery Coordinator*

*NOAA Fisheries West Coast Region*

*U.S. Department of Commerce*

Mobile: 916-955-7628

Office: 916-930-3612

[brian.ellrott@noaa.gov](mailto:brian.ellrott@noaa.gov)