

---

**From:** Joe Heublein - NOAA Federal <joe.heublein@noaa.gov>  
**Sent:** Wednesday, April 24, 2019 12:56 PM  
**To:** Rosalie del Rosario - NOAA Federal  
**Cc:** Howard Brown; Cathy Marcinkevage; Yip', 'Garwin; Brian Ellrott  
**Subject:** Re: recovery in integration and synthesis

Thanks Rosalie,

I'm trying to address most of your comments now and will reach out when I'm finished. We will probably have to discuss I&S with everyone given the potential structural changes between ROC LTO and CWF and this probably being a global issue in all the I&S sections.

Thanks again

Joe

On Tue, Apr 23, 2019 at 5:36 PM Rosalie del Rosario - NOAA Federal <[rosalie.delrosario@noaa.gov](mailto:rosalie.delrosario@noaa.gov)> wrote:  
Hi Joe,

Thanks for sharing the draft I&S for green sturgeon. I recognize the I&S is modeled after 2009 OCAP and 2017 CWF BiOps and I think the issue of consistency with the prior BiOps would be a good topic to discuss with Chris K and your management in the recommendation to place emphasis on "likelihood of survival" and "likelihood of recovery" (which are the regulatory standards for jeopardize the continued existence of...) rather than discussing I&S in terms of extinction.

I offer preliminary comments in the attached document. You'll probably have questions so feel free to set up a time to talk.

Thanks,  
Rosalie

On Thu, Apr 18, 2019 at 9:31 AM Joe Heublein - NOAA Federal <[joe.heublein@noaa.gov](mailto:joe.heublein@noaa.gov)> wrote:  
Hi Rosalie,

Things are a bit backed up in our office review and we were hoping you could review the green sturgeon I&S. I've attached the most recent section and it's also available on the server under the same title-  
R:\Draft BiOp\2\_ESA\2.8-2.9 Integration and Synthesis and Conclusion

Thanks

Joe

On Tue, Apr 16, 2019 at 10:27 AM Joe Heublein - NOAA Federal <[joe.heublein@noaa.gov](mailto:joe.heublein@noaa.gov)> wrote:  
Hi Rosalie,

Thanks for the example, I followed a similar approach in the green sturgeon section I&S for ROC LTO but made more specific reference to criteria in the recovery plan. Not sure if we closed the loop on your review but maybe we should stick with the schedule and wait until the CVO has a chance to review the I&S sections.

Thanks again

Joe

On Mon, Apr 8, 2019 at 3:59 PM Rosalie del Rosario - NOAA Federal <[rosalie.delrosario@noaa.gov](mailto:rosalie.delrosario@noaa.gov)> wrote:

Hi Joe,

Good topic and I think a brief call can be effective. I don't have a template to offer, but attached is an example biop that was shared with me that addresses recovery more explicitly (see highlights). Keep the context in mind. It's for a simpler project than ROConLTO but nevertheless helpful. I also provided comments on the draft analytical approach re: analyzing likelihood of recovery under the jeopardy standard. I recommend the analysis for each species speak directly to the recovery criteria identified in the recovery plan. McElhany's VSP is for population-specific and the recovery criteria describe what the species needs to be recovered. Again, probably best to have a brief call. My calendar is updated.

Thanks,

Rosalie

On Mon, Apr 8, 2019 at 9:38 AM Joe Heublein - NOAA Federal <[joe.heublein@noaa.gov](mailto:joe.heublein@noaa.gov)> wrote:

Hi Rosalie,

Naseem shared these thoughts on discussion of recovery criteria in integration and synthesis. Brian and I would like to have a brief call on how to incorporate a discussion of recovery criteria into the ROC LTO BO integration and synthesis section and check if you have any recent example paragraphs or templates on discussion of recovery criteria in I&S we can use. Our I&S section is due this Friday so if you can send any recent examples or templates in advance of our call that would be great.

Thanks

Joe

--

Rosalie B. del Rosario, Ph.D.  
*Regional Endangered Species Act Advisor*  
NOAA Fisheries West Coast Region  
U.S. Department of Commerce  
Office: (562) 980-4085  
[Rosalie.delRosario@noaa.gov](mailto:Rosalie.delRosario@noaa.gov)  
[www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov](http://www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov)



--

Joe Heublein  
California Central Valley Office  
650 Capitol Mall, Suite 5-100  
Sacramento, CA 95814  
Office: 916-930-3719  
FAX: 916-930-3629  
[joe.heublein@noaa.gov](mailto:joe.heublein@noaa.gov)  
[www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov](http://www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov)



--

Joe Heublein  
California Central Valley Office  
650 Capitol Mall, Suite 5-100  
Sacramento, CA 95814  
Office: 916-930-3719  
FAX: 916-930-3629  
[joe.heublein@noaa.gov](mailto:joe.heublein@noaa.gov)  
[www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov](http://www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov)



--

Rosalie B. del Rosario, Ph.D.  
*Regional Endangered Species Act Advisor*  
NOAA Fisheries West Coast Region  
U.S. Department of Commerce  
Office: (562) 980-4085  
[Rosalie.delRosario@noaa.gov](mailto:Rosalie.delRosario@noaa.gov)  
[www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov](http://www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov)



--

Joe Heublein

California Central Valley Office  
650 Capitol Mall, Suite 5-100  
Sacramento, CA 95814  
Office: 916-930-3719  
FAX: 916-930-3629  
[joe.heublein@noaa.gov](mailto:joe.heublein@noaa.gov)  
[www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov](http://www.westcoast.fisheries.noaa.gov)

